## State of New York

# Court of Appeals

# **Decisions**

February 20, 2024

#### **CASES**

1 No. 3
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Gonzalo Aguilar,
Appellant.

1 No. 11
Srecko Bazdaric et al.,
Appellants,
v.
Almah Partners LLC, et al.,
Respondents.

No. 6
Petróleos de Venezuela S.A., et al.,
Appellants,
v.
MUFG Union Bank, N.A. et al.,
Respondents.

Order affirmed.
Opinion by Judge Singas.
Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Rivera, Garcia,
Cannataro, Troutman and Halligan concur, Chief
Judge Wilson in a concurring opinion.

Order reversed, with costs, plaintiffs' motion insofar as it sought summary judgment as to liability on their Labor Law § 241 (6) cause of action granted, defendants' motion insofar as it sought summary judgment on the Labor Law § 241 (6) cause of action denied, and certified question answered in the negative.

Opinion by Judge Rivera. Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Troutman and

Halligan concur. Judge Garcia concurs in result in an opinion, in which Judges Singas and Cannataro concur.

Following certification of questions by the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit and acceptance of the questions by this Court pursuant to section 500.27 of this Court's Rules of Practice, and after hearing argument by counsel for the parties and consideration of the briefs and record submitted, first certified question, as reformulated, answered in accordance with the opinion herein and remaining questions not answered.

Opinion by Judge Troutman. Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Rivera, Garcia, Singas, Cannataro and Curran concur. Judge Halligan took no part. 2 No. 13 The People &c., Respondent, V. Fernando Ramirez, Appellant.

2 No. 4
The People &c. ex rel. Douglas G. Rankin, on behalf of Tyrone Waller,
Respondent,
v.
Cynthia Brann, &c.,
Appellant.

Order affirmed.
Opinion by Judge Cannataro.
Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Rivera, Garcia,
Singas, Troutman and Halligan concur.

Judgment reversed, without costs, habeas corpus proceeding converted into a declaratory judgment action, and judgment granted in accordance with the opinion herein.

Opinion by Judge Garcia.

Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Rivera, Singas, Cannataro, Troutman and Halligan concur.

### **MOTIONS**

4 Mo. No. 2023-655
Cheswold (TL), LLC,
Respondent,
v.
James Wynn,
Appellant,
et al.,
Defendants.

1 Mo. No. 2023-814
Peter Chien,
Appellant,
v.
James Fishman,
Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2023-632
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Abraham Fernandez,
Appellant.

On the Court's own motion, appeal dismissed, without costs, upon the ground that the order appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

On the Court's own motion, appeal dismissed, without costs, upon the ground that the orders appealed from do not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution. Motion by appellant to strike respondent's jurisdictional response denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Mo. No. 2023-626 Michael Fornino, Appellant, v. New York Central Mutual Fire Insurance Company et al., Respondents, et al., Defendant. (App. Div. No. CA 22-00897) Michael Fornino, Appellant, New York Central Mutual Fire Insurance Company, Respondent, et al., Defendants. (App. Div. No. CA 22-00898) \_\_\_\_\_ Michael Fornino, Appellant, New York Central Mutual Fire Insurance Company, et al., Defendants, W.B. Payne Company, Inc., Respondent. (App. Div. No. CA 22-00899)

Mo. No. 2023-610

The People &c.,

v. Brian France,

Respondent,

Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Mo. No. 2023-601 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Freedom Trust 2011-2, &c., Appellant, v. DB Structured Products, Inc., Respondent. Mo. No. 2023-583 Motion for leave to appeal denied. 1 Anthony G. Garcia, Appellant, v. 13 West 38 LLC, et al., Respondents. (And Third-Party Actions.) 2 Mo. No. 2023-643 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of David Gruber, Appellant, Suffolk County Board of Elections, et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2023-688 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the orders sought to be appealed from do HSBC Bank USA, N.A., &c., not finally determine the action within the meaning Respondent, of the Constitution. v. Motion for ancillary relief dismissed upon the Francis Caesar et al., ground that this Court does not have jurisdiction to Appellants, entertain it (see NY Const, art VI, § 3). et al.. Judge Halligan took no part. Defendants. Mo. No. 2023-558 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Claudia Imbert, Appellant, v.

New York State Public Employment

Relations Board, et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2023-762
Gregory D. Kilpatrick,
Appellant,
v.
Kathy Hochul, &c., et al.,
Respondents.

without costs, upon the ground that no appeal lies from the order of an individual Justice of the Appellate Division (*see* NY Const, art VI, § 3 [b]; CPLR 5601).

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the

On the Court's own motion, appeal dismissed,

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that no appeal lies from the order of an individual Justice of the Appellate Division (*see* NY Const, art VI, § 3 [b]; CPLR 5602).

1 Mo. No. 2023-501
Madison Square Garden Sports Corp., et al.,
Appellants,
v.
Factory Mutual Insurance Company, et al.

Factory Mutual Insurance Company, et al., Respondents.

4 Mo. No. 2023-576 Jason J. McGirr, Appellant,

v.

Justin Zurbrick,
Defendant,
Canalside Harbor 2013, LLC,
Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

1 Mo. No. 2023-669
Alex Pacheco,
 Appellant,
 v.
Alma Realty Corp., et al.,
 Respondents,
et al.,
 Defendant.

Motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from the Appellate Division order denying reargument or leave to appeal to this Court, dismissed upon the ground that such order does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution; motion for leave to appeal otherwise denied.

4 Mo. No. 2023-593 Raymond Panek, Appellant,

v.

Michelle Brantner, et al., Respondents.

3 Mo. No. 2023-691

In the Matter of the Claim of Jonathan Pomerantz,

Respondent,

v.

City of Newburgh Fire Department, Appellant.

Workers' Compensation Board, Respondent.

1 Mo. No. 2023-604

In the Matter of Reclaim the Records et al., Appellants,

v.

City of New York et al., Respondents.

Mo. No. 2023-570

Irving Ruderman,

Appellant,

v.

New York State Insurance Fund,

Respondent,

et al.,

Defendants.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

 Mo. No. 2023-696
 In the Matter of the Claim of Adam Schulze, Respondent,
v.
 City of Newburgh Fire Department, Appellant.
 Workers' Compensation Board,

1 Mo. No. 2023-548
Scottsdale Insurance Company,
Appellant,
v.
Mt. Hawley Insurance Company et al.,

Respondents.

Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2023-683 Bhupendra K. Shah,

Appellant,

V.

N.Y. State Office of Mental Health, et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2023-597

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Daniel Sittler,

Appellant.

4 Mo. No. 2023-640

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

David Snyder,

Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal granted.

Motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from the Appellate Division order denying appellant's motion for leave to appeal, dismissed upon the ground that such order does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution; motion for leave to appeal otherwise denied.

Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Mo. No. 2023-678 In the Matter of State of New York, Respondent, v.

Robert T.,

Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2023-768

Cheryl D. Uzamere, Appellant,

v.

Ehigie Edobor Uzamere, &c., et al., Respondents,

et al.,

Defendant.

Mo. No. 2023-512

Oscar Venegas, Appellant,

Breuer Shymer, et al.,

Defendants,

Salamon's Home Improvements, Inc., &c.,

Respondent.

(And Third-Party Actions.)

Mo. No. 2023-838

In the Matter of Linnea W.,

Appellant,

v.

Matthew P.,

Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

On the Court's own motion, appeal dismissed, without costs, upon the ground that the order appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution. Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

1 Mo. No. 2023-652 Wantmcs Holdings, LLC et al., Respondents, v.

LiveXLiveMedia, Inc., &c. et al., Respondents,

Danco Enterprises, LLC, et al., Appellants,

et al.,

Counterclaim Defendant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.